



CASES REPORTED IN PART 5

<i>R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg</i>	[2007] CTLC 183
<i>Leatherland and Pritchard v Powys County Council</i>	[2007] CTLC 192
<i>R v Clifton Steel Limited</i>	[2007] CTLC 201
<i>TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited</i>	[2007] CTLC 207

SUBJECT MATTER INDEX FOR PART 5 (For cumulative index see back page)

Abuse of process

Animal welfare – sheep unfit for sale or transportation – prosecution duty to preserve material evidence – whether destruction of carcasses after slaughter an abuse of process – whether evidence of prosecution witness who examined sheep before destruction should have been admitted

Leatherland and Pritchard v Powys County Council [2007] CTLC 192

Consumer credit

Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 15 – provision of photocopiers in return for percentage of income thereby generated – whether hire payment stipulated by the agreement – whether hire agreement

TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited [2007] CTLC 207

Evidence

Environmental Protection Act 1990 – statutory nuisance – noise – whether court entitled to reject opinion evidence of environmental health officers

R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg [2007] CTLC 183

Hire agreement

Provision of photocopiers in return for percentage of income thereby generated – whether hire payment stipulated by the agreement – whether hire agreement for the purposes of Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 15

TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited [2007] CTLC 207

Human Rights

European Convention on Human Rights Article 9 – whether finding of statutory nuisance a disproportionate interference with freedom of religion

R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg [2007] CTLC 183

Sentencing

Health and Safety at Work Act 1974 – fatal accident – whether level of fine excessive – whether degree of culpability and appellant's means to be taken into account

R v Clifton Steel Limited [2007] CTLC 201

CUMULATIVE INDEX

CASES REPORTED

	Part	Page
<i>Asda Stores Limited v Wandsworth Borough Council</i>	2	53
<i>Berwick and Haughton v Lloyds TSB Bank PLC</i>	3	106
<i>Bank of Scotland v Euclidian (No. 1) Limited and Others</i>	4	151
<i>Black Horse Limited v Christopher Langford</i>	2	75
<i>BPS Advertising Limited v London Borough of Barnet</i>	4	128
<i>Cambridgeshire County Council v Kama</i>	2	48
<i>DSG Retail Limited v Stockton-on-Tees Borough Council</i>	1	1
<i>Griffiths v Progressive Financial Services Limited t/a Welcome Financial Services</i>	1	37
<i>Hurstanger Limited v Wilson and Burton</i>	1	9
<i>Hurstanger Limited v Wilson and Burton (CA)</i>	2	59
<i>Kenworthy t/a K-Play International v North Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council</i>	3	98
<i>Leatherland and Pritchard v Powys County Council</i>	5	192
<i>Smith and Smith v Mortgage Express</i>	4	134
<i>R v Clifton Steel Limited</i>	5	201
<i>R (Donnachie) v Cardiff Magistrates' Court</i>	4	174
<i>R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg</i>	5	183
<i>TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited</i>	5	207
<i>Volkswagen Financial Services (UK) Limited v Ramage</i>	3	119
<i>Wakefield Metropolitan District Council v Nazir</i>	2	46
<i>Wilson v Robertsons (London) Limited</i>	3	84

SUBJECT MATTER INDEX

Abuse of process

Animal welfare – sheep unfit for sale or transportation – prosecution duty to preserve material evidence – whether destruction of carcasses after slaughter an abuse of process – whether evidence of prosecution witness who examined sheep before destruction should have been admitted

Leatherland and Pritchard v Powys County Council [2007] CTLC 192

Alcohol

Underage sales – due diligence defence

Cambridgeshire County Council v Kama [2007] CTLC 48

Banking

Overdraft charges – whether payable on breach – whether penalty – whether contrary to Supply and Sale of Goods Act 1982 Section 15 – whether unfair under Unfair Terms in Consumer Contract Regulations 1999

Berwick and Haughton v Lloyds TSB Bank PLC [2007] CTLC 107

Broker

Creditor's payment to broker – whether secret commission – whether breach of fiduciary duty – whether informed consent – whether rescission or other relief

Wilson and Burton v Hurstanger Limited [2007] CTLC 59 (CA)

Secret commission – creditor’s payment to broker – whether adequate disclosure
Hurstanger Ltd v Wilson and Burton [2007] CTLC 9

Case stated

Background facts to legal issues – parties’ duty to ensure material included

Asda Stores Limited v Wandsworth Borough Council [2007] CTLC 53

District Judge acting as Examining Magistrate when committing Defendant for trial – whether preliminary ruling on jurisdiction final decision – whether power to state a case
R (Donnachie) v Cardiff Magistrates’ Court [2007] CTLC 174

Submission of no case to answer – appeal by way of case stated – whether additional evidence proving the offence admissible on appeal – whether material outside case stated to be referred to

DSG Retail Limited v Stockton-on-Tees Borough Council [2007] CTLC 1

Toys (Safety) Regulations 1995 – whether safety or health jeopardised under Regulation 13 – whether failure to consider Regulation 13 rendered conviction unsafe

Kenworthy t/a K-Play International v North Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council [2007] CTLC 99

Consumer credit

Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 15 – provision of photocopiers in return for percentage of income thereby generated – whether hire payment stipulated by the agreement – whether hire agreement

TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited [2007] CTLC 207

Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 56 – deemed agency – hire purchase – dealer selling goods to credit broker for onward sale to creditor – whether promise made by dealer as deemed agent of creditor

Black Horse Limited v Christopher Langford [2007] CTLC 74

Consumer Credit Act 1974 – whether separate indemnity by insurer to funder a “security”

Bank of Scotland v Euclidian (No. 1) Limited and Others [2007] CTLC 151

Consumer Credit (Agreements) Regulations 1983 – Schedule 6 prescribed terms as to the amount of the credit, repayments and rate of interest – whether agreement compliant – Schedule 1 prescribed information on amounts of repayments – whether agreement only to be enforced on terms

Hurstanger Ltd v Wilson and Burton [2007] CTLC 9; [2007] CTLC 59 (CA)

Consumer Credit (Cancellation Notices and Copies of Documents) Regulations 1983 – whether correct to include footnote where insurance contract affected in fact but unaffected by operation of Consumer Credit Act 1974

Bank of Scotland v Euclidian (No. 1) Limited and Others [2007] CTLC 151

Consumer Credit (Total Charge for Credit) Regulations 1980 – mortgage indemnity fee – whether insurance premium – whether credit or part of the total charge for credit

Griffiths v Progressive Financial Services Limited t/a Welcome Financial Services [2007] CTLC 37

Unenforceable pawn agreement – renewal of loan on same terms for same pawn – whether amount refinanced on each occasions to be treated as received by creditor – whether amount refinanced to be repaid

Wilson v Robertsons (London) Limited [2007] CTLC 83

Unenforceable pawn agreement – claim for conversion of pawn – whether Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 170 precludes claim for conversion – whether pawnor restricted to remedies under Section 106

Wilson v Robertsons (London) Limited [2007] CTLC 83

Costs

Enforcement proceedings under Enterprise Act 2002 – investigation carried out by local authority trading standards officers – whether proportion of their salary recoverable as costs in civil proceedings

Wakefield Metropolitan District Council v Nazir [2007] CTLC 46

Whether costs against prosecuting authority or from central funds

DSG Retail Limited v Stockton-on-Tees Borough Council [2007] CTLC 1

Whether costs order substantially in excess of fine proportionate – whether fact that some costs related to a salaried officer relevant to proportionality

BPS Advertising Limited v London Borough of Barnet [2007] CTLC 128

Evidence

Environmental Protection Act 1990 – statutory nuisance – noise – whether court entitled to reject opinion evidence of environmental health officers

R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg [2007] CTLC 183

Food Safety

Food Safety (General Food Hygiene) Regulations 1995 – whether Schedule 1 Chapter IX paragraph 3 creates single offence – whether double charging

Asda Stores Limited v Wandsworth Borough Council [2007] CTLC 53

Hire agreement

Liquidated damages clause requiring payment of all future rentals less small rebate – whether penalty

Volkswagen Financial Services (UK) Limited v Ramage [2007] CTLC 120

Provision of photocopiers in return for percentage of income thereby generated – whether hire payment stipulated by the agreement – whether hire agreement for the purposes of Consumer Credit Act 1974 Section 15

TRM and Others v Lanwall Services Limited [2007] CTLC 207

Human Rights

European Convention on Human Rights Article 9 – whether finding of statutory nuisance a disproportionate interference with freedom of religion

R (Hackney London Borough Council) v Rottenberg [2007] CTLC 183

Indemnity

Whether loan unenforceable under Consumer Credit Act 1974 an “outstanding” loan “due” in the context of the indemnity

Bank of Scotland v Euclidian (No. 1) Limited and Others [2007] CTLC 151

Mortgage

Early redemption charge – whether payable on breach – whether penalty – whether contrary to Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977 Section 4 – whether unfair under Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations 1999

Smith and Smith v Mortgage Express [2007] CTLC 134

Misleading price indication

Price promises – whether true comparison

DSG Retail Limited v Stockton-on-Tees Borough Council [2007] CTLC 1

Penalty

Bank overdraft charges – whether payable on breach

Berwick and Haughton v Lloyds TSB Bank PLC [2007] CTLC 106

Hire agreement clause requiring payment of all future rentals less small rebate – whether genuine pre-estimate of loss

Volkswagen Financial Services (UK) Limited v Ramage [2007] CTLC 119

Mortgage early redemption charge – whether payable on breach

Smith and Smith v Mortgage Express [2007] CTLC 134

Sentencing

Health and Safety at Work Act 1974 – fatal accident – whether level of fine excessive – whether degree of culpability and appellant's means to be taken into account

R v Clifton Steel Limited [2007] CTLC 201

Trade Descriptions

Trade Descriptions Act 1968 – Section 1(1)(a) – alteration of odometer – whether offence committed at time of alteration or sale – Section 19 – whether “prosecutor” enforcing authority or officer laying information – whether “discovery” only when officer laying information has relevant knowledge

R (Donnachie) v Cardiff Magistrates' Court [2007] CTLC 174

Unfair Terms

Mortgage early redemption charge – whether contrary to Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977

Section 4 – whether exempted by Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations 1999

Regulation 6(2) from assessment of fairness

Smith and Smith v Mortgage Express [2007] CTLC 134

Unfair Terms in Consumer Contract Regulations 1999 – bank overdraft charges – whether exempted by Regulation 6(2) from assessment of fairness

Berwick and Haughton v Lloyds TSB Bank PLC [2007] CTLC 107